

NEWARK AND SHERWOOD DISTRICT COUNCIL

Minutes of the Meeting of **Planning Committee** held in the Civic Suite, Castle House, Great North Road, Newark, Notts, NG24 1BY on Tuesday, 6 March 2018 at 4.00 pm.

PRESENT: Councillor D Payne (Chairman)
Councillor P Handley (Vice-Chairman)

Councillor Mrs K Arnold, Councillor R Blaney, Councillor B Crowe,
Councillor Mrs M Dobson, Councillor J Lee, Councillor Mrs P Rainbow,
Councillor Mrs S Saddington, Councillor Mrs L Tift and Councillor
I Walker

APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE: Councillor Mrs C Brooks, Councillor N Mison, Councillor B Wells and
Councillor Mrs Y Woodhead

202 DECLARATION OF ANY INTENTIONS TO RECORD THE MEETING

The Chairman informed the Committee that the Council was undertaking an audio recording of the meeting.

203 MINUTES OF THE PREVIOUS MEETING

Minute No. 191 – Land Off Sandhills Sconce, Tolney Lane, Newark (17/00954/FUL), the decision should read (additions in bold text):

“Members considered the application and referred to the Gypsy and Traveller accommodation discussions that took place at the Plan Review Examination In Public which had taken place the previous week. The position on need and supply would be clarified in the coming months when the position of the GTAA was clarified. The Planning Inspector following a previous hearing regarding this site had reported that they could not justify permanent planning permission and as nothing had changed regarding the flood risk and as there was still some eight months to run on the existing temporary permission it was considered that neither a temporary or permanent permission should not be granted.

AGREED:

with 8 votes for and 5 votes against) that contrary to Officer recommendation planning permission for a permanent or temporary basis for a further three years be refused for the following reasons:

The development was in a flood plain and was at risk of flooding being mindful that on this basis the Planning Inspector on appeal could not justify a permanent permission on this site, and there is ample time remaining on the temporary permission.”

204 ORDER OF BUSINESS

With the agreement of the Committee, the Chairman changed the order of business as follows: Agenda Item 5 & 6, 14, 7 - 11, 13, 15, 16, 19, 12, 17, 18, 20 & 21. Agenda Item 20a had been withdrawn from the agenda.

205 HIGHFIELDS SCHOOL, LONDON ROAD, BALDERTON (16/01134FULM) AND (17/00357/FULM)

The Committee considered two reports of the Business Manager – Growth & Regeneration, relating to Highfields School, London Road, Balderton. The first report relating to application 16/01134/FULM sought full planning permission for the residential development comprising 89 dwellings and associated infrastructure, including the relocation of the school access, car parking area and sports pitches, the provision of a Multi-Use Games Area (MUGA) and the removal of eight TPO trees, the application was a resubmission of application 14/01964/FULM. The second report relating to application 17/00357/FULM sought planning permission for the residential development comprising ninety five dwellings and associated infrastructure, including the removal of twenty six TPO trees.

A schedule of communication was tabled at the meeting, which detailed correspondence received after the agenda was published from local residents/interested party; applicants agent; and Newark Town Council.

Planning Application 16/01134/FULM

Members considered application 16/01134/FULM and felt that the information brought before them was relevant but did not change their decision from the previously considered application in the overall planning balance.

Planning Application 17/00357/FULM

Councillor Mrs L. Hurst, representing Balderton Parish Council spoke against the application in accordance with the views of Balderton Parish Council as contained within the report. The Chairman informed her that as she had spoken on the item at a previous Planning Committee she should only inform the Committee of any information relating to any new information provided to the Committee.

Members considered application 17/00357/FULM and felt that whilst the additional information was relevant, and clearly meant a greater commitment to developer contributions overall, it still meant a shortfall in some contributions and zero affordable housing. On that basis Members remain of the view, on balance, that the level of mitigation offered was still insufficient to make the development sustainable and acceptable. Members asked that it be made clear as part of the appeal proposals, and fully consistent with the minutes of the original Planning Committee meeting at which this was refused, that concerns regarding lack of appropriate contributions/infrastructure to mitigate the development did include a lack of affordable housing.

AGREED (unanimously) that there was no change in the Councils opinion, in applying an overall planning balance, to refuse planning application 16/01134/FULM.

AGREED (unanimously) that there was no change in the Councils opinion, in applying an overall planning balance, to refuse for planning application 17/00357/FULM, with the inclusion that the lack of affordable housing contribution was part of this consideration.

206 LAND TO THE REAR OF 20 HILL VUE GARDENS, NEWARK (17/02249/FUL)

The Committee considered the report of the Business Manager – Growth & Regeneration following a site visit prior to the meeting, which sought full planning permission for the erection of four detached dwellings each with three bedrooms and an integral single garage and the demolition of the existing garages/outbuildings.

Councillor A.C. Roberts, representing Newark Town Council spoke against the application in accordance with the views of Newark Town Council as contained within the report.

A schedule of communication was tabled at the meeting, which detailed correspondence received after the agenda was published from a local resident.

Members considered the application and some Members felt that the development was not acceptable due to the loss amenity, flooding on site and too close to the high speed railway line. Other Members felt that there would be very little intrusion from overlooking. The garage site would provide much required homes rather than garages being used for storage purposes. It was also commented that some of the garages were derelict and the development would enhance the area.

(Councillor J. Lee was not present for the Officer presentation and his vote was not counted).

A vote was taken to refuse the application on the grounds of loss of amenity which was lost with 2 votes for, 7 votes against and 1 abstention.

AGREED (with 2 votes for, 7 votes against and 1 abstention) that full planning permission be approved subject to the conditions contained within the report.

207 FIELD REF. NO. 7108, EAKRING ROAD, BILSTHORPE (17/01139/OUTM) (MAJOR)

The Committee considered the report of the Business Manager – Growth & Regeneration following a site visit prior to the meeting, which sought outline planning permission for a mixed use development comprising of up to eighty five residential units and up to 280sqm of Class A1 retail space as well as associated access works including details of a new access junction into the site from Eakring Road.

A schedule of communication was tabled at the meeting, which detailed correspondence received after the agenda was published from Nottinghamshire County Council Highways; Planning Case Officer; and the Applicant.

Councillor Mrs Ward, representing Bilsthorpe Parish Council spoke against the application in accordance with the views of Bilsthorpe Parish Council as contained within the report.

Members considered the application and questioned the 5% level of affordable housing for the development and the change to the land value given the cost savings of no longer delivering a roundabout. The safety of the development was also discussed as there was no pavement or pedestrian crossing. Members requested that the application be deferred to the 3 April 2018 Planning Committee, to allow

negotiations to take place with the applicant regarding the viability of the proposal.

AGREED (unanimously) that the application be deferred to the 3 April 2018 Planning Committee, to allow negotiations to take place with the applicant regarding the viability of the proposal.

208 MIRICAL EMBLEMS LTD., MANSFIELD ROAD, BLIDWORTH (17/01698/FUL)

The Committee considered the report of the Business Manager – Growth & Regeneration following a site visit, which sought planning permission for a single storey extension to the west of the existing printing building.

A schedule of communication was tabled at the meeting, which detailed correspondence received after the agenda was published from a Mirical Emblems employee.

Members considered the application and felt that the proposal was acceptable.

AGREED (unanimously) that full planning be approved subject to the conditions contained within the report.

209 THE FARMSTEAD, MAPLEBECK ROAD, CAUNTON (17/01797/FUL)

The Committee considered the report of the Business Manager – Growth & Regeneration following a site visit, which sought full planning permission for the construction of five ecological low carbon bungalows, including a new car garage for the existing dwelling, following the demolition of the existing farm buildings.

Councillor B. Robbins, representing Caunton Parish Council spoke against the application in accordance with the views of Caunton Parish Council as contained within the report.

Members considered the application and felt that the applicants were using the design of the development to overcome planning restraints in the open countryside. Members felt that the design of the development was not as innovative as some previous applications submitted in other areas of the district. Other Members commented that the design would be good in the right place, but was not significantly innovative with the local plan or emerging local plan. It was also suggested that Caunton could reshape their village through a Neighbourhood Plan.

AGREED (with 9 votes for and 2 abstentions) that full planning permission be refused for the reasons contained within the report.

210 LAND AT REAR 37 EASTHORPE, SOUTHWELL (17/01839/FUL)

211 RAILWAY LAKE, GONALSTON LANE, HOVERINGHAM (17/01882/FULM)

The Committee considered the report of the Business Manager – Growth & Regeneration following a site visit prior to the meeting, which sought the retrospective application for the variation of condition 2 and 13 of planning

permission 15/01537/FULM – change of use of the Railway Lake to Watersport and Scouting Use, incorporating installation of portacabin for changing/training room and installation of a septic tank, to allow the portacabin to be 9.6m x 9m, with rear decking area of 4.7m x 11.8m and painted Forest Green rather than clad. In addition retention of 2.35m high compound fence, 2.53m high compound gates and 4 metal storage containers and a timber shed within the compound area.

A schedule of communication was tabled at the meeting, which detailed correspondence received after the agenda was published from Hoveringham & Thurgarton Parish Councils.

Councillor P. Turton, representing Hoveringham Parish Council spoke against the application in accordance with the views of Hoveringham Parish Council as contained within the report and in the Schedule of Communication.

Councillor R. Jackson, Local Ward Member for Dover Beck, spoke against the application on the grounds that the applicant's had not built in compliance with the planning permission granted. The villages of Hoveringham and Thurgarton had both lived for years with the gravel extraction and were promised that this area would be left as an area of natural beauty.

Members considered the application and it was commented that the site including the fencing was ugly. The fence should be reduced to the agreed height and the porta cabin should be cladded in accordance with the approved planning permission. The planting scheme undertaken on site was not suitable and different planting was required. The Planning Committee when granting the original permission were very keen on the inclusion of the conditions, to satisfy the local community and therefore felt that enforcement action should be actioned and planning permission be refused on the grounds of Green Belt harm.

AGREED (with 8 votes for and 3 votes against) that full planning permission be refused on the grounds of Green Belt harm and enforcement action be undertaken.

In accordance with paragraph 12.5 of the Planning Protocol, as the motion was against recommendation, a recorded vote was taken.

| Councillor | Vote |
|---------------------|-------------|
| Mrs K. Arnold | For |
| R.V. Blaney | Against |
| Mrs A.C. Brooks | Absent |
| R.A. Crowe | For |
| Mrs M. Dobson | For |
| G.P. Handley | For |
| J. Lee | For |
| N. Mison | Absent |
| D.R. Payne | For |
| Mrs P. Rainbow | For |
| Mrs S.E. Saddington | Against |
| Mrs L.M.J. Tift | For |

| | |
|-----------------|---------|
| I. Walker | Against |
| B. Wells | Absent |
| Mrs Y. Woodhead | Absent |

(Councillors R.A. Crowe and I. Walker left the meeting at this point).

212 RULE NO. 30 - DURATION OF MEETINGS

In accordance with Rule No. 30.1, the Chairman indicated that the time limit of three hours had expired and a motion was proposed and seconded to extend the meeting by one hour.

AGREED (unanimously) that the meeting continue for a further one hour.

213 FIELD REF. NO. 7919, CAUNTON ROAD, HOCKERTON (17/02139/OUT)

The Committee considered the report of the Business Manager – Growth & Regeneration following a site visit, which sought outline planning permission with all matters reserved for subsequent approval except for access for the erection of six new homes for local people with a specific housing need. Provision of dedicated car parking for the village hall; and areas around the village hall incorporating extension to building and new amenity area for the local community to use.

A schedule of communication was tabled at the meeting, which detailed correspondence received after the agenda was published from the Agent.

Members considered the application and one Member asked for the community assets to be completed before the houses were built. Other Members commented that whilst they admired the community benefits which may be acquired from this scheme, the development would be very prominent and was adjacent to a busy road which would also increase additional traffic to an already busy area. The village hall was not of a size for modern use. The village church was a listed building and had been closed. It was suggested that the community be encouraged to pursue the use of the church as a community venue rather than the small village hall.

AGREED (unanimously) that outline planning permission be refused for the reasons contained within the report.

214 FORMER GARAGE SITE AT THORPE CLOSE CODDINGTON (17/02294/FUL)

The Committee considered the report of the Business Manager – Growth & Regeneration which sought planning permission for the demolition of the existing garages and the development of three, two bed bungalows and one, one bed bungalow.

A schedule of communication was tabled at the meeting, which detailed correspondence received after the agenda was published from Newark & Sherwood Homes; Coddington Parish Council; and a neighbour.

Councillor Mrs Cox, representing Coddington Parish Council spoke against the

application in accordance with the views of Coddington Parish Council. The Chairman informed her that as she had spoken on the item at the previous Planning Committee she should only inform the Committee of any information relating to any new information provided to the Committee.

Councillor Mrs Cox advised the Committee that the resident residing in the middle terrace (No. 4 or 6) would not be able to access the rear of the property if planning permission was granted and felt that this was a fire risk.

The closure of Parks Close was also raised and it was commented that the closure may encourage fly tipping and vandalism in that area. A resident had a garage which was used to park her car in, she had not parked on the road for fifty years. It was requested that if the Committee were minded to approve the application that improvement works to Thorpe Close to provide additional car parking on the road side and drop kerbs be included as a condition to the planning consent.

Members considered the application and one Member queried the access to Thorpe Close and requested the widening of Thorpe Close to include additional parking to be included in the conditions. Flooding on Thorpe Close was also raised.

A Member informed the Committee that discussions regarding the widening of Thorpe Close had taken place with Newark & Sherwood Homes to address the parking issues and access for the bus service; however those improvement works would not form part of the planning application. It was commented that retaining garages for storage purposes was wrong when people required homes to live in.

A vote was taken to refuse the application on the grounds of design, loss of amenity to residents, parking issues and flooding, which was lost with 4 votes for and 5 votes against.

AGREED (with 5 votes for and 4 votes against) that full planning permission be approved subject to the conditions contained within the report.

215 GARAGE UNITS OFF, KNOTTS COURT, MAIN STREET, BALDERTON (17/02308/FUL)

The Committee considered the report of the Business Manager – Growth & Regeneration following a site visit prior to the meeting, which sought planning permission for the erection of one two bedroom bungalow following the demolition of the existing garages on the site.

A schedule of communication was tabled at the meeting, which detailed correspondence received after the agenda was published from the Agent and Officer.

Councillor Mrs L. Hurst, representing Balderton Parish Council spoke against the application in accordance with the views of Balderton Parish Council as contained within the report.

Members considered the application and welcomed the application and felt that the site was large enough to accommodate two one bed bungalows. Anti-social behaviour was reported to be undertaken on the site with children climbing onto the

garage roofs and causing damage. The Chairman suggested that a note be included to the applicant, seeking consideration of two, one bedroom bungalows.

AGREED (unanimously) that full planning permission be approved subject to the conditions and reasons contained within the report and the inclusion of a note to the applicant, seeking consideration of two, one bedroom bungalows.

216 HOLLY COTTAGE, FISKERTON ROAD, BRINKLEY (18/00030/FUL)

The Committee considered the report of the Business Manager – Growth & Regeneration, which sought Planning permission for the erection of a single storey residential annexe within the grounds of Holly Cottage.

Members considered the application and felt that the proposal was acceptable.

AGREED (unanimously) that full planning permission be approved, subject to the conditions contained within the report.

217 MAJEKA, WELLOW ROAD, OLLERTON (17/02105/FUL)

The Committee considered the report of the Business Manager – Growth & Regeneration, following a site visit prior to the meeting, which sought full Planning permission for the construction of nine single storey properties. Plans had been revised during the lifetime of the development reducing the garaging for the properties from double to single garages. The dwellings were all detailed as being three bed units with a mix of integral and stand alone garaging.

Members considered the application and commented that the site was within the village envelope and felt that the proposal was acceptable.

AGREED (with 6 votes for and 3 votes against) that full planning permission be approved subject to the conditions and reasons contained within the report.

218 CHURCH FARM, MAIN STREET, NORWELL (17/02329/FUL) AND (17/02330/LBC)

The Committee considered the reports of the Business Manager – Growth & Regeneration, which sought planning consent for alterations to the existing milking parlour to create a garden room and along with an extension to the building to create a garage and office and listed building consent for the same.

A schedule of communication was tabled at the meeting, which detailed correspondence received after the agenda was published from the Planning Case Officer recommending an additional condition as follows:

An additional condition should be added stating:

The development hereby permitted shall not be occupied at any time other than for purposes ancillary to the residential use of the dwelling, known as Church Farm on Main Street in Norwell.

Reason: To prevent the creation of a separate dwelling which would require separate

assessment against the relevant provisions of Spatial Policy 3 and the NPPF.

Members considered the application and felt that the proposal was acceptable, subject to the additional condition detailed above.

AGREED (with 8 votes for and 1 abstention) that:

(a) Planning Application (17/02329/FUL) full planning permission be granted, subject to the conditions contained within the report and the following additional condition;

(i) The development hereby permitted shall not be occupied at any time other than for purposes ancillary to the residential use of the dwelling, known as Church Farm on Main Street in Norwell.

Reason: To prevent the creation of a separate dwelling which would require separate assessment against the relevant provisions of Spatial Policy 3 and the NPPF.

(b) Planning Application (17/02330/LBC) listed building consent be granted, subject to the conditions contained within the report.

219 GLADSTONE HOUSE LORD HAWKE WAY NEWARK (18/00040/FUL)

The Committee considered the report of the Business Manager – Growth & Regeneration, which sought the provision of a further thirteen vehicle parking spaces on the eastern boundary of the site by extending the existing access road around the rear of the building. The existing landscaping would be removed and replaced accordingly.

A schedule of communication was tabled at the meeting, which detailed correspondence received after the agenda was published from the Planning Case Officer and included the applicant's site location plan as Appendix G to the schedule.

Members considered the application and felt that the proposal was acceptable.

AGREED (unanimously) that planning permission be approved, subject to the conditions contained within the report.

220 LAND AT TOP STREET, RAINWORTH (17/00865/FULM)

The application was withdrawn from the Agenda.

221 ANNUAL REPORT DETAILING THE EXEMPT REPORTS CONSIDERED BY THE PLANNING COMMITTEE

The Committee considered the report of the Business Manager Growth and Regeneration listing the exempt items considered by the Committee for the period 22 March 2017 to date.

The Committee agreed that the report considered on the 22 March 2017, relating to Forge House, Westgate, Southwell, should remain confidential.

The Committee also agreed that the reports considered on the 5 December 2017 and 6 February 2018, relating to Residential Development at Epperstone Manor, Main Street, Epperstone, should both remain confidential

AGREED that

- (a) the report considered on the 22 March 2017, relating to Forge House, Westgate, Southwell, should remain confidential and exempt; and
- (b) the reports considered on the 5 December 2017 and 6 February 2018, relating to Residential Development at Epperstone Manor, Main Street, Epperstone, should both remain confidential and exempt.

222 APPEALS LODGED

AGREED that the report be noted.

223 APPEALS DETERMINED

AGREED that the report be noted.

Meeting closed at 7.57 pm.

Chairman